

Evaluation of VSA arts Affiliate Programs

Modeling for Evaluating The Impact of the Arts on Academic, Social, and Arts Learning for Students with Disabilities

Christine Y. Mason, Mary S. Thormann, and Kathlyn M. Steedly

August 30, 2004

Note that this material is for development and internal purposes only at this time as permission to use rubrics and other materials from other sources is being obtained. VSA Affiliates are granted permission to use materials with credit to VSA.

Table of Contents

Preface	iii
Acknowledgments.....	iii
I. Overview of Evaluation Guide.....	1
The Evaluation Prototype.....	2
II. The Evaluation Framework.....	4
Bloom’s Taxonomy.....	5
III. Sample Rubrics.....	7
Using Art to Express Understanding.....	8
Using Art as a Warm Activity.....	13
Use of Rubrics to Evaluate Artistic Presentation.....	17
IV. State Standards and Other Considerations.....	18
Early Childhood, K-1st Grade.....	18
Modifications for Young Children or Students with Severe Disabilities.....	21
Impact of Art on Social Skills.....	24
Other Rubrics and Evaluation Tools.....	25
References.....	32
Additional Resources.....	33

Preface

This document is meant as a guide for VSA *arts* affiliates to assist them in designing and implementing evaluations. The rubrics that are proposed are intended as examples and sites are encouraged to consider their unique individual circumstances, including any state standards or assessments. The materials have not yet been field tested, so caution is urged until field test results are available. Because of the unique nature of this work, VSA is very interested in feedback from any teachers, sites, schools, or districts that use these rubrics or base their assessments on these rubrics. We would also appreciate copies of any rubrics that are developed, and/or data or anecdotes that you might obtain on the results of using rubrics to measure the impact of the arts. Please send feedback to Katie Steedly at katies@vsarts.org

The authors

Acknowledgments

A special thanks to teachers and VSA affiliate staff from Florida, Washington, and Michigan for their assistance in reviewing the first draft of this module. Also, during 2004 site visits were made to 10 VSA affiliates (Arizona, Florida, Iowa, Kentucky, Massachusetts, Michigan, Montana, New Jersey, Washington, and Texas) to conduct focus groups on the impact of arts on academic achievement, cognition, and social skills for students with disabilities. These visits helped us to understand more about how teachers are currently evaluating the impact of the arts.

Christine Mason, Mary Thormann, Kathlyn Steedly
August 2004

I. Overview of Evaluation Guide

Purpose

The VSA Affiliate Evaluation model is designed as a prototype to assist affiliates in their evaluation of the effectiveness and impact of their programs. In particular, this evaluation focuses on three goals related to individuals and most specifically students, with disabilities:

- The impact of arts on cognitive and academic skills
- The impact of arts on social skills
- The impact of arts instruction on the acquisition of arts skills.

During 2004, the intent is to work cooperatively with the affiliates in developing a model for measuring skill and knowledge acquisition in the above three areas. We envision that the model will provide guidance regarding validity and reliability of measurements, selection and development of appropriate evaluation tools and procedures. In addition, the model will be used to assess the current effectiveness of VSA arts sites. In this regard a developmental approach will be taken, with the expectation that greater gains will be made as sites become more knowledgeable about goal-setting, expectations, and evaluation.

The Evaluation Prototype

This prototype was developed by reviewing:

- Assessments currently being used by VSA arts affiliates and other arts programs
- Existing standards for the arts, and social and cognitive skills
- Rubrics for measuring progress in the arts and cognition
- Information and research on the effectiveness of a multiple intelligence approach to evaluation.
- Research on approaches to assessment

The model we are using is based upon both Bloom's Taxonomy (Bloom, 1956, see p. 6 of this document) and the outcomes-based model for special education developed by the National Center on Educational Outcomes (NCEO; Ysseldyke, Thurlow, & Erickson, 1994). (see http://education.umn.edu/nceo/TopicAreas/Accountability/Account_Resources.htm)

This conceptual model consists of eight domains: physical health, responsibility and independence, contribution and citizenship, academic and functional literacy, personal and social adjustment, satisfaction, accommodation and adaptation, and presence and participation. The academic and functional literacy domain will be the organizing theme for measuring student competence in

- Communication
- Problem Solving and Critical Thinking Skills
- Academic and Cognitive Skills
- Cultural Domains (Arts)
- Technology (Optional).

Indicators have been identified for each of the outcomes with the NCEO model and the model has been developed with specific outcomes and indicators for k-3, grade 5, grade 8, school completion, and post-school. With the academic and functional literacy domain for example, for grade 4, the indicators include statements of the "percentage of students who....

- Use and comprehend language that effectively accomplishes the purpose of communication
- Demonstrate problem-solving and critical thinking skills
- Competence in math to function in home, school, and community environments

- Competence in reading in home, school, and community environments
- Competence in writing to function in home, school, and community environments
- Competence in other academic domains (science, language, geography, social studies to function in home, school, and community environments
- Competence in cultural domains (fine and performing arts) to function in home, school, and community environments.

With the NCEO model, possible data sources include: performance on language tests; student contracts, portfolios, or performance records; teacher observation of students in academic environments; surveys of parents, teachers, and students; school district results on statewide assessments; rubrics; comparison of performance on tasks to rubrics; and analysis of teaching plans for domains. By grade 8, the performance indicators also include the percentage of students who need remediation in specific areas.

Within this guide are examples and recommendations for measuring these skills, and in addition, we have included recommendations for measuring changes in attitudes and social skills, as well as artistic literacy and skill.

II. Evaluation Framework: Academic and Functional Literacy for the Arts

The rubric below provides a general framework for the components of the evaluation. These components are based on the Educational Outcomes and Indicators of the NCEO as explained on the previous page. On the next two pages is related information from Bloom's taxonomy.

It is recommended that teachers use a scale to evaluate proficiency for students in the selected domain areas. For example a scale of 1-5 may be used as presented in Table 3 on p. 8.

Demonstrates competence in:

Table 1. General Framework: Overarching Rubric

	Knowledge ¹	Comprehension	Application	Analysis	Synthesis	Evaluation
Communication						
Problem Solving						
Academic and Functional Literacy						
Cultural Domains (Arts)						

Note: Below are some of the components that teachers may wish to evaluate under some of the domains. Also presented are examples of data sources.

Components

Motivation
 Interest in academics
 Participate and enjoy the arts
 Verbal and nonverbal expression
 Participate in problem solving

Data Sources:

Portfolios
 Class work/art forms
 Teacher Observations
 Tests
 Interviews/surveys with students, parents, teachers

¹ These categories are from Bloom's taxonomy. See the next two pages for hints for measuring at each level.

Bloom's Taxonomy *

The following excerpt is from the Learning Skills Program, University of Victoria. (Note: we are in the process of requesting permission to use)

<http://www.coun.uvic.ca/learn/program/hndouts/bloom.html>

Benjamin Bloom created this taxonomy for categorizing level of abstraction of questions that commonly occur in educational settings. The taxonomy provides a useful structure in which to categorize test questions, since professors will characteristically ask questions within particular levels, and if you can determine the levels of questions that will appear on your exams, you will be able to study using appropriate strategies.

Table 2.

Competence	Skills Demonstrated
Knowledge	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• observation and recall of information• knowledge of dates, events, places• knowledge of major ideas• mastery of subject matter• <i>Question Cues:</i> list, define, tell, describe, identify, show, label, collect, examine, tabulate, quote, name, who, when, where, etc.
Comprehension	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• understanding information• grasp meaning• translate knowledge into new context• interpret facts, compare, contrast• order, group, infer causes• predict consequences• <i>Question Cues:</i> summarize, describe, interpret, contrast, predict, associate, distinguish, estimate, differentiate, discuss, extend
Application	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• use information• use methods, concepts, theories in new situations

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • solve problems using required skills or knowledge • <i>Questions Cues:</i> apply, demonstrate, calculate, complete, illustrate, show, solve, examine, modify, relate, change, classify, experiment, discover
Analysis	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • seeing patterns • organization of parts • recognition of hidden meanings • identification of components • <i>Question Cues:</i> analyze, separate, order, explain, connect, classify, arrange, divide, compare, select, explain, infer
Synthesis	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • use old ideas to create new ones • generalize from given facts • relate knowledge from several areas • predict, draw conclusions • <i>Question Cues:</i> combine, integrate, modify, rearrange, substitute, plan, create, design, invent, what if?, compose, formulate, prepare, generalize, rewrite
Evaluation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • compare and discriminate between ideas • assess value of theories, presentations • make choices based on reasoned argument • verify value of evidence • recognize subjectivity • <i>Question Cues</i> assess, decide, rank, grade, test, measure, recommend, convince, select, judge, explain, discriminate, support, conclude, compare, summarize

Adapted from: Bloom, B.S. (Ed.) (1956) *Taxonomy of educational objectives: The classification of educational goals: Handbook I, cognitive domain*. New York; Toronto: Longmans, Green.

Table 3. Example of how a portion of the general framework rubric can be used.

	Knowledge ²	Comprehension	Application	Analysis	Synthesis	Evaluation
Communication						
Academic and Functional Literacy						

Students could be scored according to their level of proficiency in rubric cells that are targeted for specific tasks. For example a task may target communication and academic and functional literacy skills. In those standards areas, the teacher could be most concerned with whether the student was able to demonstrate *knowledge and application* skills. In each of those areas, teachers evaluated students according to a 5-point scale as follows:

- 5: proficient
- 4: good progress
- 3: satisfactory
- 2: needs improvement
- 1: minimal level of skill/knowledge demonstrated

In considering how to measure student progress in the arts and through the arts, early childhood educators, in particular, may want to use a developmental approach and incorporate criteria so as to measure artistic progress along a developmental continuum. (See the early childhood examples beginning on p. 16.)

III. Sample Rubrics and Background Information

The following are intended as examples of rubrics that may be appropriate, and often will be effective across grade levels. However, in many instances other rubrics may be better for specific lessons.

Please note that artistic skills in each of these may be demonstrated through music, dance, art, or theatre.

² These categories are from Bloom’s taxonomy. See the next two pages for hints for measuring at each level.

With the following rubrics, insert NA if the “cell” recommended for evaluation is not appropriate for the assignment.

Integration of Arts with English/Writing: Art used to Express Understanding with Final Product

	Needs Improvement	Followed directions with few errors	Followed Directions; no mistakes	Some interpretation; advanced knowledge; original thought	Showed Appreciation of topic; thoughtful reflection; built on other work	Evaluated impact of action/words
Adequate planning						
Quality of draft writing						
Originality, imagination, problem solving						
Demonstrated comprehension						
Demonstrated knowledge of contextual factors (economics, social, political, psychological, cultural concerns)						
Completeness/thoroughness						
Elaboration, addition of interesting detail						
Use of art to enhance or complement meaning						
Technical aspects of writing/art						
Quality of final product						

Integration of Arts with Reading: Art used to Express Understanding with Final Product

	Needs Improvement	Followed directions with few errors	Followed Directions; no mistakes	Some interpretation; advanced knowledge original thought	Showed Appreciation of topic; thoughtful reflection; built on other work	Evaluated impact of action/words
Adequate planning						
Decoding						
Comprehension of Main Idea						
Knowledge of Main Characters, Sequence of Events; factual understanding						
Knowledge of supporting details						
Understanding of conflict resolution/ cause and effect						
Elaboration, addition of interesting detail, generalization						
Use of art to enhance or complement meaning						
Technical aspects of art						
Quality of final product						

**Integration of Arts with Social Studies: Art used to Express Understanding
with Final Product**

	Needs Improvement	Followed directions with few errors	Followed Directions; no mistakes	Some interpretation; advanced knowledge; original thought	Showed Appreciation of topic; thoughtful reflection; built on other work	Evaluated impact of action/words
Adequate planning						
Quality of draft writing						
Accurately portrayed time period, historical facts. Geography						
Demonstrated comprehension						
Demonstrated knowledge of contextual factors (economics, social, political, psychological, cultural concerns), problem solving						
Completeness/thoroughness						
Elaboration, addition of interesting detail						
Use of art to enhance or complement meaning						
Technical aspects of writing/art						
Quality of final product						

Integration of Arts with Science: Art used to Express Understanding with Final Product

	Needs Improvement	Followed directions with few errors	Followed Directions; no mistakes	Some interpretation; advanced knowledge; original thought	Showed Appreciation of topic; thoughtful	Evaluated impact of action/words
Adequate planning						
Quality of draft writing/product						
Accurately portrayed scientific principles						
Demonstrated comprehension						
Demonstrated knowledge of contextual factors (economics, social, political, psychological, cultural concerns), problem solving						
Completeness/thoroughness						
Demonstrated knowledge of cause/effect relationships						
Elaboration, addition of interesting detail						
Use of art to enhance or complement meaning						
Technical aspects of writing/ Scientific procedures/ Art						
Quality of final product						

Integration of Arts with Math: Art used to Express Understanding with Final Product

	Needs Improvement	Followed directions with few errors	Followed Directions; no mistakes	Some interpretation; advanced knowledge; original thought	Showed appreciation of topic; thoughtful reflection; built on other work	Evaluated impact of action/words
Adequate planning						
Quality of draft writing/mathematical calculations/product						
Accurately portrayed mathematical principles						
Demonstrated comprehension						
Completeness/thoroughness. Problem solving						
Elaboration, addition of interesting detail						
Use of art to enhance or complement meaning						
Technical aspects of writing/ Mathematical calculations/Art						
Quality of final product						

Cross-Disciplinary Integration of Arts: Art used to Express Understanding with Final Product

	Needs Improvement	Followed directions with few errors	Followed Directions; no mistakes	Some interpretation; advanced knowledge; original thought	Showed Appreciation of topic; thoughtful reflection; built on other work	Evaluated impact of action/words
Adequate planning						
Quality of draft						
Accurately portrays understanding of principles of specific disciplines (math, science, social studies, English)						
Demonstrated comprehension of topic						
Completeness/thoroughness. Problem solving						
Elaboration, addition of interesting detail						
Use of art to enhance or complement meaning						
Technical aspects of writing/ Calculations/Art						
Quality of final product						

For example, with a unit on conservation, the student may use art to portray the history of efforts to promote good ecology and conservation of natural resources in the United States. This thematic unit may include a study of the problems that were created during specific time periods, solutions that evolved, the influence of politics and socio-economic factors, and recommendations for the future. Students may study this topic in science, history, and in English; in English the study may include reading a science fiction story and/or writing a story or developing a multi-media production to display problems and solutions. Art could be used to visually display cause and effect, to establish the mood, to dramatize a scenario or display a slogan for an improved environment, and/or in a multi-media production.

Using Art as a Warm-Up Activity

Sometimes art is used to introduce a subject or during the initial phases of learning rather than as a culminating or final activity. In these cases, teachers will be interested in use of time, engagement, creative thought, imagination, consideration of one or more possible outcomes, and demonstration of background knowledge in preparation for the lesson. While a modification of the rubric is given for English/Writing, similar modifications could be made for other subjects.

Example for English/Writing:

	Needs Improvement	Followed directions with few errors	Followed Directions; no mistakes	Some interpretation; advanced knowledge; original thought	Showed Appreciation of topic; thoughtful reflection; built on other work	Evaluated impact of action/words
Adequate planning						
Use of artistic medium						
Originality, imagination, problem solving						
Demonstrated comprehension of background knowledge						
Demonstrated knowledge of contextual factors (economics, social, political, psychological, cultural concerns)						
Elaboration, addition of interesting detail						
Verbal or written description of what art portrays						
Quality of product						

Use of Rubrics to Evaluate Quality of Artistic Presentation

The *National Standards for Arts Education* (Consortium of National Arts Education Associations, 1994) includes comprehensive standards for measuring artistic abilities and performance. These standards will be appropriate for students, including students with disabilities, who display significant artistic talent and are considering an arts education after graduation from high school. However, these standards can also help to inform arts instruction for all students. As indicated in this document

Standards for arts education are important for two fundamental reasons. First, they help define what a good education in the arts should provide: a thorough grounding in a basic body of knowledge and skills required both to make sense and to make use of each of the arts disciplines—including the intellectual tools to make qualitative judgments about artistic products and expression. Second, when states and school districts adopt the standards, they are taking a stand for rigor, informed by a clear intent. (p. 12)

The following examples refer to pages from the National Standards (1994). Note that these are intended only as examples and other rubrics may better meet the criteria for specific lessons.

Dance Standards, K-4, p. 23

	Needs Improvement	Basic; Few errors	Satisfactory, No errors	Combines, Applies in Context	Graceful, portrays emotion; improvises	Works alone & with partner, extended performance
Defines and maintains personal space						
Creates shapes at low, middle, and high levels						
Demonstrates axial movements (bend, twist, stretch, swing)						
Demonstrates locomotor movements (walk, run, hop, slide)						
Demonstrates movements in straight and curved pathways						
Kinesthetic awareness, concentration, and focus						
Movement with beat/responding to changes in tempo						
Observes and describes action and movement elements (levels, direction)						

Theatre Standards (k-4, p. 30)

	Needs Improvement	Basic; Few errors	Satisfactory, No errors	Combines, Applies in Context	Technical skills; portrays emotions; improvises	Works alone & with partner, extended performance
Collaborates to select situations for classroom dramatizations						
Improvises dialogue to tell stories						
Assumes roles						
Visualizes and creates environments						
Creates Dramatization						
Compares and connects art forms						
Uses visual element to enhance mood						
Explains character differences, analyzes dramatizations						
Compares across stories, dramas, cultures, and theatre media (stage, film, television)						

Visual Arts (grades 9-12, p. 69)

	Needs Improvement	Basic; Few errors	Satisfactory, No errors	Demonstrates skill, sensitivity, understanding of medium	Advanced ability, understanding, creativity
Applies media, techniques, and processes					
Creates works of visual arts					
Communicates ideas through one visual arts medium					
Uses organizational principles and functions to solve visual arts problems					
Creates multiple solutions to visual arts problems					
Applies symbols, subjects, and ideas in artworks					
Understands visual arts in relation to history and culture					
Reflects on and assesses merits of own work and that of others					

IV. State Standards and Other Considerations

Early Childhood, K-1st Grade

Educators may find it useful to combine their criteria for performance with state standards for art. We have provided a few ideas to help teachers understand how this might be accomplished, choosing to focus our example on early childhood through first grade. Educational standards for students from all states can be found at the Web site for the Education World State Standards at <http://www.education-world.com/standards/state/index.shtml>

Example 1. Music Example from Ohio State Standards.

Pistone, N. & Lowther, R. (2004) Arts Academic Content Standards. Columbus, Ohio: Ohio Department of Education. Retrieved on August 30, 2004 from http://www.ode.state.oh.us/Academic_Content_Standards/acsarts.asp.

Benchmark B: Explain the settings and circumstances in which dance is found in their lives and the lives of others both past and present.

Kindergarten

3. Identify when and in what settings people dance.

Grade One

2. Create movements that represent animal actions and behaviors.
3. Demonstrate and share dances from cultural events (e.g., dance company performances, festivals and holiday celebrations) in their schools and/or communities.

Benchmark A: Improvise, create and perform movement phrases with concentration and kinesthetic awareness.

Kindergarten

1. Identify and perform basic locomotor (e.g., skipping and hopping) and nonlocomotor movements (e.g., bending and twisting).

Grade One

1. Perform locomotor and nonlocomotor movements with the ability to start, change, stop and balance.

Benchmark C: Invent multiple solutions to movement problems varying space, time and energy.

Kindergarten

4. Perform movements that emphasize the use of space (e.g., direction, path and level of movement).

Grade One

3. Perform movements that emphasize time and energy.

Benchmark A: Describe their responses to movement experiences using dance vocabulary.

Kindergarten

1. Explore and describe everyday movements in dance (e.g., walking, running and skipping).
2. Respond to a dance by describing its basic features (e.g., speed, space, costume and setting).

Grade One

1. Demonstrate movements and gestures in response to direction (e.g., bend, jump and reach).

Benchmark A: Relate ideas and concepts from the arts and other content areas to expressive movement.

Kindergarten

1. Invent movement ideas inspired by a stimulus (e.g., a painting, a costume or a percussion instrument) from another arts discipline.
2. Connect movement and rhythm by synchronizing movements to rhythm.

Grade One

1. Improvise dance movements to tell a simple story with a beginning, middle and end.
2. Improvise dance movements in response to an idea or concept from a content area outside the arts (e.g., mathematics—subtraction or reading—parts of a story).

Possible Rubric based on Ohio State Standards, Grade 1.

	Needs Improvement	Basic; Few errors	Satisfactory, No errors	Combines, Applies in Context	Graceful, portrays emotion; improvises	Works alone & with partner, extended performance
Create movements that represent animal actions and behavior.						
Demonstrate and share dances from cultural events in schools/communities						
Perform locomotor and nonlocomotor Movements with the ability to start, change, stop, and balance.						
Perform movements that indicate time and energy						
Demonstrates movements and gestures in response to directions e.g. (bend, jump, and reach).						
Improvise movements to tell a simple story with beginning, middle, and end						
Improvise dance movements in response to an idea outside of the arts (e.g. mathematics-subtraction, or reading-parts of a story.)						

Example 2. Theater Arts Example from Florida State Standards.

Standard:

The student acts by developing, communicating, and sustaining characters in improvisation and formal or informal productions. (TH.A.1.1)

Standard. Standard 1: The student understands applications of the role of theater, film, television, and electronic media in everyday life. (TH.E.1.1)

	Needs Improvement	Basic; Few errors	Satisfactory, No errors	Combines, Applies in Context	Graceful, portrays emotion; improvises	Works alone & with partner, extended performance
1. Uses role playing to resolve everyday conflict situations (e.g., fighting over a toy, bullying others, and stealing someone's property).						
2. Understands the similarities and differences among how emotions are expressed in theater, dramatic media, music, dance, and visual art.						
3. Cooperates with others to create formal and informal theatrical works and to solve the problems inherent in simple scenes (e.g., listens while others speak, sets goals, shows self-discipline, and meets deadlines).						

Modifications for Young Children or Students with Severe Disabilities

The sample rubrics may need to be modified for very young children or individuals with severe disabilities. The following example demonstrates how the *Start with the Arts* curriculum can be evaluated through the use of rubrics.

Example from Starts with the Arts Curriculum. Unit: the World Around Me (p.325)

	Needs Improvement	Satisfactory Progress	Demonstrated skill/knowledge with few errors or misunderstandings	Proficient: Demonstrated skill/knowledge with no errors	Demonstrates advanced understanding/int erpretation in larger context	
Recognizes the life stages of a butterfly						
Developed vocabulary related to butterflies						
Identified the sequence of events						
Created a butterfly and an environment for its home						
Use of art to display understanding						
Technical Aspects of Art						
Quality of Final Product						

The following example demonstrates how the “Integration of Arts with Reading” rubric on p.9 has been modified for a student with moderate to severe cognitive impairment.

Integration of Arts with Reading: Art used to Express Understanding with Final Product

	Needs Improvement	Followed directions with few errors, some prompting	Followed Directions; no mistakes; little prompting	Demonstrates ability to use in multiple situations; no prompting	Demonstrates additional related knowledge	Can predict outcomes/danger if signs are not obeyed
Adequate planning						
Decodes basic survival words/signs						
Comprehension of basic survival words/signs						
Can use basic sight/survival words or demonstrate their meaning in appropriate context or conversation						
Uses art to display understanding						
Technical aspects of art						
Quality of final product						

Impact of Art on Social Skills

	Needs improvement	Basic, few errors some prompting	Follows directions, no errors, little prompting	Displays appropriate social skills, little prompting	Generalizes social skills	Evaluates appropriateness of social behavior
Uses appropriate social skills for short time period (1-5 minutes) in specific situations						
Uses appropriate social skills for 6-15 minutes in specific situations						
Uses appropriate social skills for 16-30 minutes in several situations						
Uses appropriate social skills in many different situations for over 30 minutes						
Can demonstrate appropriate social skills through art						
Technical aspects of art						
Quality of final product						

Note this rubric could be modified to evaluate engagement, time on task, motivation, attitudes. Appropriate social skills, and any other behaviors targeted for observation should be defined so that they can be reliably measured.

Note also, that a wide array of behaviors could be measured. With the NCEO model, at grade 8, for example, the area of personal and social adjustment includes outcome indicators on:

- Copes effectively with personal challenges, frustrations, and stressors
- Has a good self image
- Respects cultural and individual differences
- Gets along with other people

Other Rubrics and Related Evaluation Materials:

Dalton, J. & Smith, D. (1986) “Extending Children’s Special Abilities – Strategies for primary classrooms” pp.36-7 (We are in the process of obtaining permission to use)

Knowledge	Comprehension	Application	Analysis	Synthesis	Evaluation
---------------------------	-------------------------------	-----------------------------	--------------------------	---------------------------	----------------------------

Knowledge

Useful Verbs	Sample Question Stems	Potential activities and products
tell list describe relate locate write find state name	What happened after...? How many...? Who was it that...? Can you name the...? Describe what happened at...? Who spoke to...? Can you tell why...? Find the meaning of...? What is...? Which is true or false...?	Make a list of the main events.. Make a timeline of events. Make a facts chart. Write a list of any pieces of information you can remember. List all the in the story. Make a chart showing... Make an acrostic. Recite a poem.



Comprehension

Useful Verbs	Sample Question Stems	Potential activities and products
explain interpret outline discuss distinguish predict restate translate compare describe	Can you write in your own words...? Can you write a brief outline...? What do you think could of happened next...? Who do you think...? What was the main idea...? Who was the key character...? Can you distinguish between...? What differences exist between...? Can you provide an	Cut out or draw pictures to show a particular event. Illustrate what you think the main idea was. Make a cartoon strip showing the sequence of events. Write and perform a play based on the story. Retell the story in your words. Paint a picture of some aspect you like. Write a summary report of an event. Prepare a flow chart to illustrate the sequence of events. Make a colouring book.

	example of what you mean...? Can you provide a definition for...?	
--	--	--



Application

Useful Verbs	Sample Question Stems	Potential activities and products
solve show use illustrate construct complete examine classify	Do you know another instance where...? Could this have happened in...? Can you group by characteristics such as...? What factors would you change if...? Can you apply the method used to some experience of your own...? What questions would you ask of...? From the information given, can you develop a set of instructions about...? Would this information be useful if you had a ...?	Construct a model to demonstrate how it will work. Make a diorama to illustrate an important event. Make a scrapbook about the areas of study. Make a paper-mache map to include relevant information about an event. Take a collection of photographs to demonstrate a particular point. Make up a puzzle game using the ideas from the study area. Make a clay model of an item in the material. Design a market strategy for your product using a known strategy as a model. Dress a doll in national costume. Paint a mural using the same materials. Write a textbook about... for others.



Analysis

Useful Verbs	Sample Question Stems	Potential activities and products
analyse distinguish examine compare contrast investigate	Which events could have happened...? I ... happened, what might the ending have been? How was this similar	Design a questionnaire to gather information. Write a commercial to sell a new product. Conduct an investigation to produce information to

categorise identify explain separate advertise	to...? What was the underlying theme of...? What do you see as other possible outcomes? Why did ... changes occur? Can you compare your ... with that presented in...? Can you explain what must have happened when...? How is ... similar to ...? What are some of the problems of...? Can you distinguish between...? What were some of the motives behind...? What was the turning point in the game? What was the problem with...?	support a view. Make a flow chart to show the critical stages. Construct a graph to illustrate selected information. Make a jigsaw puzzle. Make a family tree showing relationships. Put on a play about the study area. Write a biography of the study person. Prepare a report about the area of study. Arrange a party. Make all the arrangements and record the steps needed. Review a work of art in terms of form, colour and texture.
--	---	---



Synthesis

Useful Verbs	Sample Question Stems	Potential activities and products
create invent compose predict plan construct design imagine propose devise formulate	Can you design a ... to ...? Why not compose a song about...? Can you see a possible solution to...? If you had access to all resources how would you deal with...? Why don't you devise your own way to deal with...? What would happen if...? How many ways can you...? Can you create new and unusual uses for...?	Invent a machine to do a specific task. Design a building to house your study. Create a new product. Give it a name and plan a marketing campaign. Write about your feelings in relation to... Write a TV show, play, puppet show, role play, song or pantomime about...? Design a record, book, or magazine cover for...? Make up a new language code and write material using it. Sell an idea. Devise a way to... Compose a rhythm or put new words to a known melody.

	<p>Can you write a new recipe for a tasty dish? can you develop a proposal which would...</p>	
--	--	--



Evaluation

Useful Verbs	Sample Question Stems	Potential activities and products
judge select choose decide justify debate verify argue recommend assess discuss rate prioritise determine	Is there a better solution to... Judge the value of... Can you defend your position about...? Do you think ... is a good or a bad thing? How would you have handled...? What changes to ... would you recommend? Do you believe? Are you a ... person? How would you feel if...? How effective are...? What do you think about...?	Prepare a list of criteria to judge a ... show. Indicate priority and ratings. Conduct a debate about an issue of special interest. Make a booklet about 5 rules you see as important. Convince others. Form a panel to discuss views, eg "Learning at School." Write a letter to ... advising on changes needed at... Write a half yearly report. Prepare a case to present your view about...

**RI K-12 Arts Framework
Dance Standards**

<http://www.arts.ri.gov/education/dance.htm> (We are in the process of requesting permission to use.) RI has many pages like these. It is interesting to compare the expectations across grade levels.

Standard 1. CREATION/PERFORMANCE - All students will engage in self or group expression by creating original or interpreting works of art.

Descriptor	By Grade 4	By Grade 8	By Grade 10	By Grade 12
<i>Apply knowledge of concepts and structures to create original and interpretive works of art</i>	Create a movement phase with a beginning, middle and end; demonstrate the processes of reordering and change, improvise and create dances based on their own ideas and concepts from other sources.	Create movement compositions using principles of contrast and transition; demonstrate structures and forms (for example, AB, ABA, CANON, CALL and RESPONSE and NARRATIVE.	Create short original work demonstrating an understanding of choreographic processes, structures and forms which clearly demonstrate a quality, emotion, concept or narrative.	Create a longer original work demonstrating an understanding of choreography processes, structures and forms which clearly demonstrate a quality, emotion, concept or narrative.
<i>Apply knowledge of media, tools, techniques and processes to create original and interpretive works of art</i>	Create and solve movement problems through the use of improvisation, partner skills, research and accompaniment; reproduce a taught sequence of movements.	Generate movement and choreography employing movement vocabulary for clear expression; solve choreographic problems through research;	Produce and arrange improvised movement vocabulary to create a dance; create ensemble work; demonstrate/explain how production elements (stage, lighting,	Produce and rearrange improvised vocabulary to create an aesthetically whole dance; create ensemble work reflecting understanding of space, time and energy; demonstrate/

		demonstrate/ explain the role of lighting and costuming contributions to the meaning of a dance.	sound, costume, props) affect the communication of the main ideas of the dance.	explain how production elements (stage, lighting, sound, costume, props) affect the communication of the main ideas of the dance
--	--	--	---	---

From Washington State (We are requesting permission to use.)

Framework Introduction

The intent of the Office of Superintendent of Public Instruction and the Washington State ARTs Framework is to provide support for the development of The ARTs benchmarks and instructional guidelines for individual school districts. The combination of efforts at the state and local levels should ensure that all elements of the Essential Academic Learning Requirements in The ARTs are addressed at each grade level.

The ARTs represent a universal expressive language that humans use to make sense of the world. Study in The ARTs requires and develops mental discipline, physical control, and freedom of spirit. Acquiring the language of an art form is a sequential process based on the acquisition of developmentally appropriate knowledge and skills necessary for creating, performing and responding (CPR) to The ARTs. **Our continuous goal is to offer and support a comprehensive and sequential K-12 ARTs program, available to all learners in Washington State.**

An example for 5th grade follows:

Fifth Grade Frameworks

Note: These documents are presented as The Arts EALRs Frameworks formatted by content and by grade level.

Grade 5	Dance	Music	Theatre	Visual Arts
1. The student understands and applies arts knowledge and skills.				
1.1.1 Understands arts concepts and vocabulary: Elements	Benchmark 1: Identifies and uses visual art, dance, theatre and music vocabulary and concepts			
	Performs movement which includes accent and rest (time) Creates and performs free and controlled movement (energy)		Identifies and describes character traits within a scene / play Identifies and describes the use of mood within the setting of a scene / play Identifies and describes the sequence of actions that make up the beginning middle and end of a scene / play	Understands and demonstrates the use of line through direction, type, and quality Understands and demonstrates the relationship of 2D shapes to 3D forms Uses a color wheel to demonstrate color relationships Recognizes and demonstrates actual and simulated texture Recognizes and uses spatial devices and concepts to create depth Recognizes and demonstrates a range of values

1.1.2 Understands arts concepts and Vocabulary: <i>Principles of Organization</i>	Benchmark 1: Identifies and uses visual art, dance, theatre and music vocabulary and concepts			
	Creates a simple dance, combining a variety of dance elements and principles of organization (choreography)	Identifies and uses the following musical notation: sharp, flat, tie (notation) Identifies and performs simple musical forms (i.e. theme & variation) Aurally discriminates between major and minor	Identifies multiple conflict resolutions within plot in a scene/play Identifies and describes costume, set, props, sound as elements of design in a scene/play Compares and contrasts main ideas in multiple scenes / plays	Identifies and applies pri

References

Bloom, B.S. (Ed.) (1956) *Taxonomy of educational objectives: The classification of educational goals: Handbook I, cognitive domain.* New York , Toronto: Longmans Green.

Dalton, J. & Smith, D. (1986). *Extending Children's Special Abilities: Strategies for primary classrooms.*

Available from <http://www.teachers.ash.org.au/researchskills/dalton.htm>

[Accessed 3 April 2003]

Ysseldyke, J., Thurlow, M., & Erickson, R. (1994), *Educational Outcomes and Indicators.* Minneapolis, MN: National Center on Educational Outcomes.

Additional Resources

Rubrics:

http://www.njaet.org/ettc/teacher_tools.htm#rubrics

<http://rubistar.4teachers.org/index.php>

http://teachers.teach-nology.com/web_tools/rubrics/

<http://www.landmark-project.com/index.php>

<http://school.discovery.com/schrockguide/assess.html>

<http://www.ncsu.edu/midlink/bk.rep.fic.htm>

<http://www.ga.k12.pa.us/curtech/WEBQPRE/assesspp.htm>

<http://www.goshen.edu/art/ed/rubric2.html>

<http://www.goshen.edu/art/ed/rubric3.html>

<http://etc.sccoe.k12.ca.us/i98/ii98Units/Cross/BLTCE/Patti/text/rubrica.html>

<http://www.webproject.org/digital/rubric.html>

<http://eprentice.sdsu.edu/s03x2/gutierrez/ART%20RUBRIC.doc>

<http://www.zimmerworks.com/rubric.htm>

<http://www.austinschools.org/davis/Rubric.html>

http://intranet.cps.k12.il.us/Assessments/Ideas_and_Rubrics/Rubric_Bank/rubric_bank.html

Summary of Large-Scale Arts Partnership Evaluations

File Format: PDF/Adobe Acrobat - [View as HTML](#)

Summary of **Large-Scale Arts Partnership Evaluations** Rob Horowitz **Arts Education Partnership** January 2004 Pre-publication copy Permission to copy, disseminate ...

From the Arts Education Partnership. An online and print publication on the impact of arts on learning:

<http://www.aep-arts.org/Champions.html>.

Arts Education Partnership
One Massachusetts Avenue, NW, Suite 700
Washington, DC 20001-1431
Information Line: (202) 326-8693
Fax Number: (202) 408-8081
E-mail: aep@ccsso.org

Other Related Publications:

Publications:

All of these publications can be ordered through the Council of Chief State School Officers (CCSSO) using the ordering information above. Click on the report name to view in .pdf format.

<u>Envisioning Arts Assessment</u>	A guide to help design large-scale art assessment decisions. Also provides informational support and activities to be used as both a practical tool and reference. Available for purchase at the shipping cost of \$4.95.
<u>Teaching Partnerships: Report of a National Forum on Partnerships Improving Teaching on the Arts</u>	13 exemplary partnerships convened at Lincoln Center, New York, NY to determine best policies and actions needed to insure that the arts are being well taught in America's education system. Report examines collaborations between colleges and universities, public education system at the state and local level and arts and cultural organizations. Available for purchase at a cost of \$2.00. Contact the Publications Office for shipping discount for 10 or more copies
<u>Critical Links: Learning in the Arts and Student Academic and Social Development</u>	The Compendium summarizes and discusses 62 research studies that examine the effects of arts learning on students' social and academic skills. (May 16, 2002 release date) Available for purchase at a cost of \$25.00 plus \$4.00 shipping. \$1.00 for each additional book. Discounts available for bulk orders.
<u>Champions of Change: The Impact of the Arts on Learning</u>	A report that compiles seven major studies that provide new evidence of enhanced learning and achievement when students are involved in a variety of arts experiences. (1999) Available for purchase at a cost of \$5 plus \$3 for shipping.
Champions of Change Executive Summary	This publication summarizes the findings from the seven studies found in Champions of Change, but does not provide descriptions of them. (1999) Available for purchase at a cost of \$1 plus \$1 for shipping. <i>This is not available in .pdf format at this time.</i>
<u>Gaining the Arts Advantage: Lessons from School Districts that Value Arts Education</u>	A report featuring case studies and profiles of 91 school districts throughout the United States that are recognized for offering arts education throughout their schools. Identifies the critical factors that must be in place to implement and sustain comprehensive arts education. Stresses the essential role of community involvement and partnerships. (1999) Available for purchase at a cost of \$10 plus \$4 for shipping.
<u>Gaining the Arts Advantage: More Lessons from School Districts that Value Arts Education</u>	A report from an October 2000, meeting in which 32 school districts from 19 states discussed the current status of arts education in their districts. These districts were profiled in the Partnership's 1999 report, <i>Gaining the Arts Advantage: Lessons From School Districts That Value Arts Education</i> . Available for purchase at a cost of \$2 plus shipping.
<u>Why Your Child Needs the Arts Advantage and How You Can Gain It</u>	A companion brochure that highlights the findings of the two-year study <i>Gaining the Arts Advantage: Lessons From School Districts that Value Arts Education</i> . (2000) Available for purchase in bulk (10 or more) at a cost of \$.25 each.
<u>Learning Partnerships: Improving Learning in Schools with Arts Partners in the Community</u>	Presents the major impacts on school policy and practices, the principles of effectiveness and key questions to be addressed at each stage of development of successful arts education partnerships. (1999) Available for purchase at a cost of \$1 for shipping.
<u>Strengthening State-Level Arts Education Partnerships</u>	The Arts Education Partnership, in cooperation with four of its national partners, convened arts education consultants from state departments of education across the country on April 12 and 13, 2000, in Washington, DC. Available for purchase at a cost of \$1 plus \$1 for shipping.
<u>Young Children and the Arts: Making Creative Connections</u>	Provides guiding principles and recommendations to organizations to support the development of arts-based early childhood programs and resources. (1998) Available for purchase at the shipping cost of \$1.50 for 1-10 copies; \$1.00 for 11-50 copies; or \$.50 for 51-89 copies. For orders of 90 or more, contact CCSSO to determine shipping costs.

Publications available in .pdf format or copies in bulk only:

Eloquent Evidence: Arts at the Core of Learning	This brochure from the President's Committee on the Arts and the Humanities and the National Assembly of State Arts Agencies summarizes research about how the arts increase academic achievement. *Available for purchase from the National Assembly of State Arts Agencies.
--	--

<p><u>Good Schools Require the Arts</u></p>	<p>Discusses the purpose and accomplishments of the Arts Education Partnership (formerly the Goals 2000 Arts Education Partnership) and its more than 100 national arts, education, business and philanthropic organizations. Provides guidance on how to join the Partnership. (1998)</p>
<p>Priorities for Arts Education Research</p>	<p>Identifies ten major priorities for research in arts education and presents a rationale for each. Five focus on the impact on student learning and five on the information needed for policy making. (1997) <i>*Available in bulk of 10 or more at the cost of \$4.95 shipping fee</i></p>
<p>The Focus is on the States</p>	<p>A focus group on representatives from 13 states and the District of Columbia, each a manager of a Leadership Fund project, met in Washington, DC on June 27, 1996, to discuss the challenges, successes and needs in integrating the arts permanently into education policies and programs in their states.</p>